| 1 | The Honorable Ricardo S. Martinez | | | | |
|----------|--|---|--|--|--|
| 2 | | | | | |
| 3 | | | | | |
| 4 | | | | | |
| 5 | | | | | |
| 6 | | | | | |
| 7 | | | | | |
| 8 9 | UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE | | | | |
| 10 | | | | | |
| 11 | Dlaintiff CIVIL ACTION NO.: CV04-1852RSM | | | | |
| 12 | | | | | |
| 13 | v. | AMENDED PRELIMINARY | | | |
| 14 | JOHN STEFANCHIK, individually and as an officer and director of Beringer Corporation, | INJUNCTION AND ORDER FOR OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF AS TO DEFENDANTS JOHN STEFANCHIK AND THE BERINGER CORPORATION | | | |
| 15 16 | SCOTT B. CHRISTENSEN, individually and as an officer and director of Atlas Marketing, Inc., | | | | |
| 17 18 | BERINGER CORPORATION, dba The | | | | |
| 19 20 | ATLAS MARKETING, INC., also dba The Stefanchik Organization, a Nevada Corporation, | | | | |
| 21 | Defendants. | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | |
| 23 | Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("Commission" or "FTC"), has filed a Complaint | | | | |
| 24 | | , , | | | |
| 25 | for permanent injunction and other equitable relief pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), charging defendants John Stefanchik, Scott B. | | | | |
| 26 | | | | | |
| 27 | | | | | |
| 28 | | p-1111111 in connection with the effect than the | | | |

| 1 | Internet marketing and telemarketing of course materials, in-person workshops, videotapes, audio | [|
|----|---|---------|
| 2 | tapes and other products and services that purport to teach consumers how to make money | |
| 3 | brokering, purchasing, and/or reselling privately held mortgages or promissory notes thv2(s)e31hv2(-60.UT | D-0.31) |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | | |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | | |
| 10 | | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | | |
| 13 | | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |

- 4. The acts and practices of the Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. This Court has the authority to grant a preliminary injunction and other appropriate relief pursuant to Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and Rule 65 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. FTC v. Gem Merch. Corp., 87 F.3d 466, 468-69 (11th Cir. 1996); FTC v. World Travel Vacation Brokers, Inc., 861 F.2d 1020, 1025-26 (7th Cir. 1988).
- 6. Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), authorizes the issuance of such preliminary relief upon a proper showing that, weighing the equities and considering the Commission's likelihood of ultimate success, such action would be in the public interest.
- 7. Section 5(a) of the FTC Act prohibits deceptive acts and practices in or affecting commerce. To be deceptive, an act or practice must be one that is likely to mislead consumers acting reasonably under the circumstances, and is material. FTC v. Pantron I Corp., 33 F.3d 1088, 1095 (9th Cir. 1994), *citing* Cliffdale Assocs., Inc., 103 F.T.C. 110, 164-65 (1984).
- 8. The Telemarketing Sales Rule prohibits telemarketers and sellers from misrepresenting directly or by implication, any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer, 16 C.F.R. §310.3(a)(2)(iii), and from making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods and services, 16 C.F.R. §310.3(a)(4).
- 9. Defendants are "sellers" or "telemarketers" engaged in "telemarketing" as those terms are defined in the Telemarketing Sales Rule. 16 C.F.R. § 310.2(cc).
- 10. The FTC has demonstrated a likelihood of success on the merits under Section 5(a) of the FTC Act and under the TSR. As demonstrated by the excerpts taken from Defendants' direct mail pieces, Internet web site, telemarketing scripts, and sworn consumer declarations, the Defendants have claimed that consumers who purchase Defendants' products or services will quickly make large amounts of money in their spare time by learning and using the methods taught therein, and that Defendants' personal coaching service is staffed by persons substantially experienced in the paper business who are readily available by telephone to assist consumers in finding and completing paper transactions. As demonstrated by the declarations of

consumers and Manoj Hastak, Ph.D., and the results of the survey Dr. Hastak has conducted of Defendants' purchasers, these claims are likely to be false and/or unsubstantiated and in violation of both Section 5(a)of the FTC Act and the TSR.

11. Weighing the equities and considering the FTC's likelihood of success, entry of this Preliminary Injunction and Order for Other Equitable Relief ("Order") is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

- 1. "**Defendants**" means John Stefanchik and Beringer Corporation, doing business collectively with the other defendants in this action as "The Stefanchik Organization," and each of them, by whatever names each might be known, as well as their successors and assigns, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device.
- 2. "Assisting others" means knowingly providing any of the following goods or services to another entity: (1) performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; (2) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any telephone sales script or any other marketing material; (3) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; (4) providing the fulfillment services for the marketing or sale of any product or service; or (5) performing marketing services of any kind.
- 3. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
- 4. "**Paper Business**" means the business of finding, brokering, creating, purchasing, and/or selling privateeee(d)-38.1 m(o)-58.1(r)-45.1(t)-60.3(g)-38.1(a)-34.3(g)-38.1(e)28.9(s)-28.9 (o)-58.1(r)-45.1(p)-38.

" erson

- G. In connection with telemarketing, as defined in the Telemarketing Sales Rule, violating or assisting others to violate any provision of the Rule, including, but not limited to:
 - 1. Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer, in violation of Section 310.3(a)(2)(iii) of the Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(2)(iii); and
 - 2. Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for any good or service in violation of Section 310.3(a)(4) of the Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(4).

II. NOTICE OF CORPORATE OR PERSONAL ASSET TRANSACTIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, including by facsimile, are hereby restrained and enjoined from any transfer of any money or tangible or intangible assets or any expenditure with a value of over ten thousand dollars (\$10,000.00) from the date of entry of this Order, without disclosing to the Commission, at least five (5) business days prior to the transfer or expenditure, the purpose and recipient of such transfer or expenditure. The funds, property, and assets affected by this Part shall include both existing assets and assets acquired after the date of entry of this Order, including, without limitation, those acquired by loan or gift.

III. PROHIBITED DISCLOSURE OF CONSUMER LISTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and

telephone number, credit card number, bank account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person who has paid any money to any Defendant in connection with promoting, offering for sale, selling, or participating in the sale of, directly or indirectly, any target product or service. *Provided*, however, that Defendants may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order.

IV. RECORD KEEPING/BUSINESS OPERATIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, and their officers, agents, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, including by facsimile, in connection with the advertising, promotion, marketing, offering for sale, or sale of any target product or service, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Failing to create and maintain documents that, in reasonable detail, accurately, fairly, and completely reflect the Defendants' incomes, disbursements, transactions, and use of money, beginning as of the date of entry of this Order;
- B. Failing to make and keep books, records, accounts, bank statements, current accountants' reports, general ledgers, general journals, cash receipt ledgers, cash disbursement ledgers and source documents, documents indicating title to real or personal property, and any other documents or electronic data which, in reasonable detail, accurately and fairly reflect the

| 1 | D. | Failing to maintain complete records of any consumer complaints and disputes, |
|----|----------------|---|
| 2 | whether com | ing from the consumer or any intermediary, such as a government agency or Better |
| 3 | Business Bur | reau, and any responses made to those complaints or disputes; and |
| 4 | E. | Creating, operating or exercising any control over any business entity, including |
| 5 | any partnersh | nip, limited partnership, joint venture, sole proprietorship, or corporation, without |
| 6 | first providin | g the Commission with a written statement disclosing: (1) the name of the business |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | | |
| 10 | | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | | |
| 13 | | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |

| 1 | SO ORDERED , this3 day of, 2005. | |
|---------------------------------|---|--|
| 2 | _/S/ Ricardo S. Martinez | |
| 3 | The Honorable Ricardo S. Martinez United States District Judge | |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | | |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | Respectfully presented by: | |
| 8 9 | <u>s/Nadine Samter</u> Nadine S. Samter, WSBA # 23881 Eleanor Durham, Member MD Bar | |
| 10 | Kial Young, Mass Bar # 633515 Federal Trade Commission | |
| 11 | 915 Second Ave., Suite 2896 Seattle, WA 98174 | |
| 12 | (206) 220-6350 FAX (206) 220-6366 | |
| 13 | EMAIL: nsamter@ftc.gov edurham@ftc.gov | |
| 14 | kyoung@ftc.gov | |
| 1516 | ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |