

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES**

**09 11 2018  
592134**

**In the Matter of**

**Tronox Limited  
a corporation,**

**National Industrialization Company  
(TASNEE)  
a corporation,**

**National Titanium Dioxide Company  
Limited (Cristal)  
a corporation,**

**And**

**Cristal USA Inc.  
a corporation.**

**ORIGINAL**

**Docket No. 9377**

**JOINT SUBMISSION TO THE COURT**

On Thursday, September 6, 2018, this Court requested supplemental briefing to address “the effect of the district court’s opinion and order on any factual or legal issue in this case, including the preclusive effect, if any, of the district court’s factual findings, legal conclusions, or judgment.” *See* Dkt. 9377, Order Requiring Supplemental Post-Trial Briefs (Sept. 6, 2018). In response, the parties jointly submit the following:

1. Judge Trevor N. McFadden held a hearing on Complaint Counsel’s motion for a preliminary injunction on August 7-9, 2018. The District Court allowed each side to present live testimony from three witnesses of their choosing and the parties submitted briefs outlining their positions and the complete administrative record. The District Court entered an order granting Complaint Counsel’s Motion on September 5, 2018. *See Federal Trade Commission v. Tronox Limited, et al.*, 1:18-cv-01622 (TNM), Dkt. 105.
2. The federal district court’s decision was decided on the preliminary injunction standard expressed in 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and this merits action was brought pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 45(b). The decision and findings of the federal district court have no preclusive effect on this Court’s decision concerning the legality of the proposed transaction. *See ProMedica Health Sys., Inc.*, 152 F.T.C. 708, 711 (2011). This Court may consider the district-court decision persuasive authority to the extent it deems appropriate.

With the parties having jointly submitted this response, the parties waive any right to file reply briefs and respectfully ask the Court to consider the briefing on this matter closed for purposes of Rules 3.46 and 3.51 of the Federal Trade Commission’s Part 3 Rules. The parties respectfully ask the Court to reschedule closing arguments expeditiously.

Dated: September 11, 2018

Submitted By:

/s/ Michael F. Williams, P.C.

Michael F. Williams, P.C.

Karen McCartan DeSantis

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

655 Fifteenth Street, N.W.

Suite 1200

Washington, D.C. 20005

(202) 879-5000

(202) 879-5200 (facsimile)

michael.williams@kirkland.com

karen.desantis@kirkland.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR TRONOX LIMITED**

/s/ James L. Cooper

James L. Cooper  
Peter J. Levitas  
Ryan Z. Watts  
Katherine E. Clemons  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20001-3743  
(202) 942-5000  
(202) 942-5999 (facsimile)  
james.cooper@arnoldporter.com  
peter.levitas@arnoldporter.com  
ryan.watts@arnoldporter.com  
katherine.clemons@arnoldporter.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR NATIONAL  
INDUSTRIALIZATION COMPANY  
(TASNEE), THE NATIONAL TITANIUM  
DIOXIDE COMPANY LIMITED (CRISTAL),  
AND CRISTAL USA INC.**

/s/ Dominic Vote

Dominic Vote  
Deputy Assistant Director  
Federal Trade Commission  
Bureau of Competition  
400 7th Street SW  
Washington, D.C. 20024  
Phone: (202) 326-3505  
Email: [dvote@ftc.gov](mailto:dvote@ftc.gov)

**COUNSEL SUPPORTING COMPLAINT**



**CERTIFICATE FOR ELECTRONIC FILING**

I certify that the electronic copy sent to the Secretary of the Commission is a true and correct copy of the paper original and that I possess a paper original of the signed document that is available for review by the parties and the adjudicator.

September 11, 2018

By: /s/ Michael F. Williams  
Michael F. Williams

Notice of Electronic Service

**I hereby certify that on September 11, 2018, I filed an electronic copy of the foregoing Joint Submission to the Court, with:**

D. Michael Chappell  
Chief Administrative Law Judge  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Suite 110  
Washington, DC, 20580

Donald Clark  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Suite 172  
Washington, DC, 20580

**I hereby certify that on September 11, 2018, I served via E-Service an electronic copy of the foregoing Joint Submission to D. Michael Chappell**

Michael Becker  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
mbecker@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Karen McCartan DeSantis  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
kdesantis@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Megan Wold  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
megan.wold@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Michael DeRita  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
michael.derita@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Charles Loughlin  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
cloughlin@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Cem Akleman  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
cakleman@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Thomas Brock  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
TBrock@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Krishna Cerilli  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
kcerilli@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Steven Dahm  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
sdahm@ftc.gov  
Complaint

E. Eric Elmore  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
eelmore@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Sean Hughto  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission

shughto@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Joonsuk Lee  
Attorney  
@aRocj T\* teKfC C Mission



Federal Trade Commission  
cwaldeck@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Katherine Clemons  
Associate  
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP  
katherine.clemons@arnoldporter.com  
Respondent

Eric D. Edmondson  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
eedmondson@ftc.gov  
Complaint

David Morris  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
DMORRIS1@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Zachary Avallone  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
zachary.avallone@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Rohan Pai  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
rpai@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Rachel Hansen  
Associate  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
rachel.hansen@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Peggy D. Bayer Femenella  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
pbayer@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Grace Brier  
Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
grace.brier@kirkland.com  
Respondent

Alicia Burns-Wright  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
aburnswright@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Janet Kim  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission

jkim3@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Andrew Pruitt  
Attorney