

1111 Superior Avenue, Suite 200 Cleveland, Ohio 44114 (216) 263 3455 - United States of America FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION East Central Region

> Jon Miller Steiger Director

August 23, 2022

CEASE AND DESIST DEMAND

VIA EMAIL TO: aamar@familycommunication.it noc@familycommunication.it

Family Communication Inc. c/o Fahid Mustafa, CEO 3040 Hone Avenue Bronx, NY 10469

We have determined that Family Communication Inc. is apparently routing and transmitting illegal robocall traffic, directly or indirectly, for entities involved in the following campaigns:

- x Amazon imposter authorized order
- x Amazon imposter suspicious charge
- x Authorized order
- x Government imposter Social Security Administration
- x Law enforcement or legal action notice

More specifically, our investigation revealed that Family Communication Inc. apparently routed and transmitted illegal robocalls, as set forth in Attachment A.

The Federal Trade Commission (FTC) works closely with USTelecom's Industry Traceback Group (ITG), which is the registered industry consortium selected pursuant to the TRACED Act to conduct tracebacks.¹ Between January 18, 2021, and July 19, 2022, ITG investigated 30 prerecorded voice message calls that law enforcement, voice service providers using honeypots (i.e., unassigned numbers held by providers to detect illegal robocalls), and customers of YouMail had flagged as illegal robocalls made without consent of the called party.² ITG conducted tracebacks and determined that Family Communication Inc. routed and transmitted the calls. ITG previously notified you of these calls and provided you access to

¹ SeePallone-Thune Telephone Robocall Abuse Criminal Enforcement and Deterrence Act, Pub. L. No. 116-105, 133 Stat. 3274, Sec. 13(d) (2019) (TRACED Act).

² See16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v).

assisting and facilitating claims against technology companies that knowingly provided software and servers used by illegal robocallers, even though these technology companies did not contract directly with the illegal robocallers. See FTC v. James B. Christia Case No. 8:18-cv-00936 (C.D. Cal. May 31, 2018).

We also bring to your attention that the FTC has sued VoIP service providers for allegedly violating the TSR. In FTC v. Educare the FTC alleged that defendant Globex Telecom, Inc. assisted and facilitated telemarketers it knew, or consciously avoided knowing, were violating the TSR's prohibitions on calls delivering prerecorded messages. See FTC v. Educare Centre Services, InNo. 3:19-cv-00196-KC (W.D. Tex. Dec. 3, 2019).⁶ In September, 2020, Globex Telecom and its associates agreed to pay \$2.1 million to settle the FTC lawsuit, and Globex Telecom's former CEO and President was banned from telemarketing to the U.S. and was subject to a permanent court order.⁷ Similarly, in FTC v. AlcazaNetworks, Inc.the FTC alleged that Alcazar Networks, Inc. and its founder and sole owner assisted and facilitated telemarketers responsible for tens of millions of illegal telemarketing calls, including robocalls and spoofed calls that displayed "911" as the caller ID. See FTC v. Alcazar Networks Inc., et al. No. 6:20-cv-2200 (M.D. Fla. Dec. 3, 2020).⁸ As part of their settlement with the FTC in January 2021, the defendants agreed to a permanent injunction that prohibits similar misconduct in the future and requires them to screen and monitor their customers, as well as imposing a monetary penalty.⁹

The FTC has business educational materials that can assist you in complying with the TSR. See<u>https://www.ftc.gov/tips-advice/business-center/guidance/complying-telemarketing-sales-rule</u>.

In addition to FTC regulations and the FTC's actions against providers of VoIP services, you should also be aware that the United States Department of Justice (DOJ), state attorneys general, and other agencies have brought civil actions against VoIP companies and their owners. In two cases, DOJ alleged that the defendants were committing and conspiring to commit wire fraud by knowingly transmitting robocalls that impersonated federal government agencies.¹⁰ In August 2020, a federal district court entered a permanent court order barring the defendants from conveying telephone calls into the U.S. telephone system.¹¹ State cases have had similar impacts.¹²

⁶ A copy of the FTC's Amended Complaint is attached as Attachment C.

⁷ See<u>https://www.ftc.gov/news-events/press-releases/2020/09/globex-telecom-associates-will-pay-21-million-settling-ftcs-first</u>.

⁸ A copy of the FTC's Complaint is attached as Attachment D.

⁹ See<u>https://www.ftc.gov/news-events/press-releases/2020/12/ftc-takes-action-against-second-voip-service-provider</u>.

¹⁰ See<u>https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/department-justice-files-actions-stop-telecom-carriers-</u>who-facilitated-hundreds-millions.

¹¹ See<u>https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/district-court-enters-permanent-injunction-shutting-down-telecom-carriers-who-facilitated</u>.

¹² For example, the Vermont and Michigan Attorneys General have brought successful actions against VoIP providers who route scam robocall traffic. See

Within three business days, please send a message to FTC attorney Fil Maria de Banate, via electronic mail at fdebanate@ftc.gov, certifying that Family Communication Inc. has ceased engaging in the activities described above that may subject it to liability under the TSR or the FTC Act. Please direct any inquiries regarding this letter to Mr. de Banate by email or by telephone at 216.263.3413.

Sincerely,

Miller

Jon Miller Steiger Director

Enclosures: Attachment A (Chart of illegal robocalls) Attachment B (TSR) Attachment C (EducareAmended Complaint) Attachment D (Alcazar Complaint)

https://ago.vermont.gov/blog/2021/04/28/attorney-general-donovan-announces-settlement-withscam-robocall-carrier/; https://www.michigan.gov/documents/ag/Assurance_of_Voluntary_Compliance_-_All_Access_Telecom_FINAL_9-11-20_702047_7.pdf, and, https://www.michigan.gov/ag/0,4534,7-359--536108--s,00.html.

ATTACHMENT A

Date of ITG Notification	Date of Call	Caller ID	Robocall Campaign Identifier	Link to Robocall Recording	Potential Violation
7/19/2022	7/17/2022	4408995598	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/959857	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
7/18/2022	7/17/2022	8282978154	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/959878	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
7/11/2022	7/10/2022	6036651250	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/951273	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
6/22/2022	6/17/2022	3176028654	Amazon-SuspiciousCharge-P1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/924832	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
6/14/2022	6/8/2022	5099939268	Amazon-SuspiciousCharge	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/892635	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/23/2022	5/21/2022	8066856829	Legal-Consequences	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/868741	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/23/2022	5/20/2022	9176225592	Legal-Consequences	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/868734	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/23/2022	5/20/2022	8433198922	Legal-Consequences	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/868731	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/23/2022	5/20/2022	9155615476	Legal-Consequences	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/868729	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/20/2022	5/17/2022	7632606180	Authorized-Order	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/864698	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/19/2022	5/17/2022	7134746344	LegalDept-Action-P1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/859409	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/19/2022	5/16/2022	8288638057	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/857388	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/19/2022	5/16/2022	6015588997	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/857381	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/19/2022	5/16/2022	7346060301	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/857376	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/12/2022	5/7/2022	9176723540	Amazon-SuspiciousCharge-P1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/838941	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)

5/12/2022	5/7/2022	8596241622	Amazon-SuspiciousCharge-P1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/838931	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
5/12/2022	5/7/2022	8437778709	Amazon-SuspiciousCharge-P1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/838919	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
4/8/2022	4/7/2022	5033123233	Amazon-SuspiciousCharge-P1	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/800146	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
1/12/2022	1/10/2022	5105888068	SSA-KindlyPressOne	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/630197	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
12/9/2021	12/7/2021	9179307243	SSA-KindlyPressOne	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/584752	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
12/8/2021	12/6/2021	6626260391	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/582920	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/13/2021	11/11/2021	5138721787	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/557684	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/13/2021	11/10/2021	8596947396	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/557662	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/8/2021	11/3/2021	2703410948	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549488	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/6/2021	11/3/2021	3128126138	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549499	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/5/2021	11/3/2021	3022834973	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549502	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/5/2021	11/3/2021	8599884884	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549490	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/5/2021	11/2/2021	8023773186	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549476	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/4/2021	11/3/2021	6065071531	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549491	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)
11/4/2021	11/3/2021	6017613051	Amazon-AuthorizeOrder	https://portal.tracebacks.org/api/public /attachments/549483	16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(v)